IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

re Patent Application of

THOMPSON et al

Atty. Ref.: 36-1951

Serial No. 10/560,615

TC/A.U.: 3624

Filed: December 14, 2005

Examiner:

For: NEGOTIATION SYSTEM

May 4, 2006

Commissioner for Patents P.O. Box 1450 Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

INFORMATION DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

Attention is directed to the attached PCT and GB Search Reports in a counterpart of this application and to a copy of each non-US patent document newly cited therein and/or otherwise known to the inventors. A Form PTO-1449 is also attached.

Official consideration and citation of all identified documents is requested.

Zeus (http://labs.bt.com/projects/agents/zeus/) is an open source agent development tool kit that was created at BT in the late 1990's and early 2000's as part of the Midas and Agentcities research projects as a platform for the setting of negotiation episodes.

The description of goods and services offered by electronic agents to one another is also an area of great activity. Two significant groups have been working on this area. The WS-I have proposed a common web service profile language which describes the service in terms of how to invoke it. The DARPAWeb Service group have developed DAML-S which is an XML based service description language. DAML-S describes the service simply in terms of what it does. Applicant's present invention takes a different view by developing a method for describing the behaviors expected of participants in an auction, and an engine that can interpret these descriptions and act on them. In particular, applicants have developed an exemplary system wherein:

- Descriptions are in terms of the phases of activity in an interaction. For example, it is
 possible to specify a pre-qualification phase, a phase in which the characteristics of
 the good are negotiated and a phrase in which the price of the good is negotiated.
- The outcomes of the phases of the negotiation can be tied together in a way that can be interpreted by a program; it is possible to specify a concept like "the price agreed in phase s2 will be the only price that will be legal in phase s3". This is significant because it constrains the size of the space that agents must reason over when composing bids at each phase. Importantly this constraint cannot only be applied going forward in the auction (that is to say that a constraint that has been specified for a previous phase applies to the reasoning to be used in this phase) but also in previous phases as well. In the example above agents that interpret the service description will be able to reason that since price will be constrained in subsequent phases in phase s1 other considerations (quality, time of delivery, support and servicing) are subordinate.

Applicant has identified six references could be retrieved using the keywords "negotiation and description".

Of these

- EP 1161038 & EP 1158445 appear to refer to mechanical negotiation for voice over
 IP connections
- WO 0221789 and US 2002/029201 are concerned with specifying privacy constraints in an interaction
- US 6,055,519 refers to a canonical negotiation system
- US 6,347,307 describes a way of stating the type of interaction to be conducted.
 However it uses a taxonomy/ontology (FinXML) which specifies interactions such as "spot", "InterestRateFixedFloatSwap" whereas applicant's system uses a componentized characterization such as describing the interaction in terms of a number of phases, the characteristics of the phases and the constraints between the phases and on the logical description of the overall outcome of the interaction.
- CMU (DARPA) have implemented a language called DAML-S. DAML-S does
 not have a descriptive ontology for interactions, but does have a process model
 which can be used to explicitly describe protocols.

THOMPSON et al Serial No. 10/560,615

- 2. University of Southampton and HP Labs have implemented a software framework which does utilize an ontology for negotiation. However, applicant's exemplary system uses a different descriptive method which decomposes the steps of negotiation more fully. In HP's system of rules applicant's system can place more emphasis on lifecycle rules. HP only identify terminal rules, whereas applicant's can describe transitions in the negotiation process. Applicant's exemplary system also can have constraints between the phases of the negotiation.
- University of Liverpool and HP Labs have done work similar to the work above.
 However, there is a difference in that the object of the negotiation is discussed.
 However, the object is not related to the negotiation state.
- 4. FIPA, RosettaNet and ebXML initiatives define a number of different negotiation protocols by an explicit, informal description. See www.fipa.org for examples.
- 5. In previous work, applicant has developed the line of reasoning described by the University of Liverpool, University of Southampton and HP Labs into a pattern language which combines some of the formal and informal characteristics of protocol description systems. This is mainly intended as a grounded documentation tool.

Respectfully submitted,

NIXON & VANDERHYE P.C.

LSN:vc

901 North Glebe Road, 11th Floor

Arlington, VA 22203-1808 Telephone: (703) 816-4000

Facsimile: (703) 816-4100

	of 1		2				
INFORMATION DISCLOSURE CITATION		ATTY. DOC	CKET NO. MAY 0.4 2000	SERIAL NO.			
		36-1951 \(\frac{1}{2} \) MAY 0 4 2006		10/560,615			
		APPLICAN					
		THOME	PSON et al				
(Use several sheets if necessary)		FILING DATE		TC/A.U.		-	
		December 14, 2005					
		Decem	Der 14, 2005	3624			
		U.S.	. PATENT DOCUMENTS				
AMINER NITIAL	DOCUMENT NUMBER	DATE	NAME	CLASS	SUBCLASS	FILING IF APPR	
	6401080 B1	06/2002	Bigus et al.				
	6347307 B1	02/2002	Sandhu et al.				
	6055519	04/2000	Kennedy et al.				
	2002/0029201 A1	03/2002	Barzilai et al				
		EODEI	GN PATENT DOCUMENTS		<u> </u>	<u> </u>	
						TRANS	
	DOCUMENT	DATE	COUNTRY	CLASS	SUBCLASS	YES	NO.
	WO 02/03297 A2	01/2002	WIPO		ļ		ļ
	WO 02/21789 A2	03/2002	WIPO				<u> </u>
	1158445 A1	11/2001	Europe		<u> </u>		ļ
	1161038 A2	12/2001	Europe				ļ
						<u> </u>	
		1 1		I		1	
			uding Author, Title, Date, Pe				
	Aknine, "E-Commerce a	and Web Techno	ologies 3 rd International Conferen	ice, EC-Web 2002		", publisl	ned 20
	Aknine, "E-Commerce a Springer Verlag, see pag	and Web Technoge 17, section 1,	ologies 3 rd International Conferent page 18, section 3.1 and page 20	ce, EC-Web 2002 , section 3.2.1	Proceedings'		
	Aknine, "E-Commerce a Springer Verlag, see pag Carbo et al., "Proceeding	and Web Technoge 17, section 1, gs of the IASTE	ologies 3 rd International Conferen	nce, EC-Web 2002 , section 3.2.1 ficial Intelligence a	Proceedings'		
	Aknine, "E-Commerce a Springer Verlag, see pag Carbo et al., "Proceedin published 2001, ACTA	and Web Technoge 17, section 1, gs of the IASTE Press, see abstra	ologies 3 rd International Conferen , page 18, section 3.1 and page 20 ED International Conference Artif	ice, EC-Web 2002 b, section 3.2.1 ficial Intelligence a re 1	Proceedings	ons, AIA	<u>'01",</u>
	Aknine, "E-Commerce a Springer Verlag, see pag Carbo et al., "Proceedin published 2001, ACTA Robinson et al., "Comm pages 95-102, see Figure	and Web Technoge 17, section 1, gs of the IASTE Press, see abstraunications of the s 1 and 2, see p	ologies 3 rd International Conferent, page 18, section 3.1 and page 20 ED International Conference Artifact, page 389, section 3 and Figure ACM, Vol. 41, No. 5, May 199 page 96 righthand column and page	ice, EC-Web 2002), section 3.2.1 ficial Intelligence a re 1 8, "Supporting the ge 102 righthand co	Proceedings and Application Negotiation column	ons, AIA	'01", le",
	Aknine, "E-Commerce a Springer Verlag, see pag Carbo et al., "Proceeding published 2001, ACTA Robinson et al., "Comm pages 95-102, see Figur David et al., "Bidders St	and Web Technoge 17, section 1, gs of the IASTE Press, see abstraunications of the 1 and 2, see parategy For Multiple 1.	ologies 3 rd International Conferent, page 18, section 3.1 and page 20 ED International Conference Artifact, page 389, section 3 and Figur e ACM, Vol. 41, No. 5, May 199 page 96 righthand column and page 11-Attribute Sequential English Artifaction 19 and 19 an	ice, EC-Web 2002), section 3.2.1 ficial Intelligence a re 1 8, "Supporting the ge 102 righthand co	Proceedings and Application Negotiation column	ons, AIA	'01", le",
	Aknine, "E-Commerce a Springer Verlag, see pag Carbo et al., "Proceedin published 2001, ACTA Robinson et al., "Comm pages 95-102, see Figur David et al., "Bidders St 1-58113-683-8/03/0007	and Web Technonics 17, section 1, gs of the IASTE Press, see abstrations of the s 1 and 2, see parategy For Multiple 14 July 2002, j	ologies 3 rd International Conferent page 18, section 3.1 and page 20 ED International Conference Artifact, page 389, section 3 and Figure ACM, Vol. 41, No. 5, May 199 page 96 righthand column and page 11-Attribute Sequential English Appages 457-464, XP002302633	ice, EC-Web 2002 b, section 3.2.1 ficial Intelligence a re 1 8, "Supporting the ge 102 righthand co uction with a Dead	Proceedings Ind Application Negotiation Dlumn line", AAMA	ons, AIA Life Cyc AS 03, N	'01", le", o. AC
	Aknine, "E-Commerce a Springer Verlag, see pag Carbo et al., "Proceedin published 2001, ACTA Robinson et al., "Comm pages 95-102, see Figur David et al., "Bidders St 1-58113-683-8/03/0007 Becker et al., "Transition	ge 17, section 1, gs of the IASTE Press, see abstraunications of the s 1 and 2, see ptrategy For Multi, 14 July 2002, jn-Independent I	ologies 3 rd International Conferent, page 18, section 3.1 and page 20 ED International Conference Artifact, page 389, section 3 and Figur e ACM, Vol. 41, No. 5, May 199 page 96 righthand column and page 11-Attribute Sequential English Artifaction 19 and 19 an	ice, EC-Web 2002 b, section 3.2.1 ficial Intelligence a re 1 8, "Supporting the ge 102 righthand co uction with a Dead	Proceedings Ind Application Negotiation Dlumn line", AAMA	ons, AIA Life Cyc AS 03, N	'01", le", o. AC
	Aknine, "E-Commerce a Springer Verlag, see pag Carbo et al., "Proceedin published 2001, ACTA Robinson et al., "Comm pages 95-102, see Figur David et al., "Bidders St 1-58113-683-8/03/0007 Becker et al., "Transition 2003, pages 41-48, XP0	ge 17, section 1, gs of the IASTE Press, see abstraunications of the s 1 and 2, see ptrategy For Multi, 14 July 2002, jn-Independent I 02302634	ologies 3 rd International Conferent page 18, section 3.1 and page 20 ED International Conference Artifact, page 389, section 3 and Figure ACM, Vol. 41, No. 5, May 199 page 96 righthand column and page 11-Attribute Sequential English Appages 457-464, XP002302633 Decentralized Markov Decision P	ice, EC-Web 2002 b, section 3.2.1 ficial Intelligence a re 1 8, "Supporting the ge 102 righthand couction with a Dead rocesses", AAMAS	Proceedings nd Application Negotiation blumn line", AAMA	Life Cyc AS 03, N 2003, 18	'01", le", o. AC
	Aknine, "E-Commerce a Springer Verlag, see pag Carbo et al., "Proceedin published 2001, ACTA Robinson et al., "Comm pages 95-102, see Figur David et al., "Bidders St 1-58113-683-8/03/0007 Becker et al., "Transition 2003, pages 41-48, XPO Bartolini et al., "Archite	and Web Technologe 17, section 1, gs of the IASTE Press, see abstraunications of the s 1 and 2, see parategy For Multi, 14 July 2002, pn-Independent I 02302634 acting for Reuse.	ologies 3 rd International Conferent page 18, section 3.1 and page 20 ED International Conference Artifact, page 389, section 3 and Figure ACM, Vol. 41, No. 5, May 199 page 96 righthand column and page 11-Attribute Sequential English Appages 457-464, XP002302633	ice, EC-Web 2002 b, section 3.2.1 ficial Intelligence a re 1 8, "Supporting the ge 102 righthand couction with a Dead rocesses", AAMAS	Proceedings nd Application Negotiation blumn line", AAMA	Life Cyc AS 03, N 2003, 18	'01", le", o. AC
	Aknine, "E-Commerce a Springer Verlag, see pag Carbo et al., "Proceedin published 2001, ACTA Robinson et al., "Comm pages 95-102, see Figur David et al., "Bidders St 1-58113-683-8/03/0007 Becker et al., "Transition 2003, pages 41-48, XP0 Bartolini et al., "Archite Road, BS34 8QZ, Bristo	and Web Technologe 17, section 1, gs of the IASTE Press, see abstraunications of the s 1 and 2, see parategy For Multiple 14 July 2002, 101, 14 July 2002, 102302634 acting for Reuser of UK, 2002	ologies 3 rd International Conferent page 18, section 3.1 and page 20 ED International Conference Artifact, page 389, section 3 and Figure ACM, Vol. 41, No. 5, May 199 page 96 righthand column and page 11-Attribute Sequential English Appages 457-464, XP002302633 Decentralized Markov Decision P	ice, EC-Web 2002 b, section 3.2.1 ficial Intelligence a re 1 8, "Supporting the ge 102 righthand co function with a Dead rocesses", AAMAS	Proceedings and Application Negotiation blumn line", AAMA S 03, 14 July a", HP Labor	Life Cyc AS 03, N 2003, 18 atories, I	'01", le", o. AC 3 July
	Aknine, "E-Commerce a Springer Verlag, see page Carbo et al., "Proceeding published 2001, ACTA Robinson et al., "Commerce as 95-102, see Figure David et al., "Bidders Start 1-58113-683-8/03/0007 Becker et al., "Transition 2003, pages 41-48, XPO Bartolini et al., "Archite Road, BS34 8QZ, Bristo Fonseca et al., "Towards Engineering Bldg, Santa	and Web Technoge 17, section 1, gs of the IASTE Press, see abstraunications of the es 1 and 2, see parategy For Multi, 14 July 2002, pn-Independent I 02302634 ecting for Reuse ol, UK, 2002 s an Agent Nego a Cruz, CA and	ologies 3 rd International Conferent page 18, section 3.1 and page 20 ED International Conference Artifact, page 389, section 3 and Figure ACM, Vol. 41, No. 5, May 199 page 96 righthand column and page 1:-Attribute Sequential English Appages 457-464, XP002302633 Decentralized Markov Decision Pattern Language", UC S BTexact Technologies, Orion Bu	ice, EC-Web 2002 I, section 3.2.1 Inicial Intelligence a re 1 Is, "Supporting the ge 102 righthand couction with a Dead rocesses", AAMAS omated Negotiation anta Cruz/BTexact	Proceedings and Application Negotiation plumn line", AAMA S 03, 14 July 1", HP Labor Technologie	Life Cyc AS 03, N 2003, 18 atories, I	'01", le", o. AC 3 July Filton
	Aknine, "E-Commerce a Springer Verlag, see page Carbo et al., "Proceeding published 2001, ACTA Robinson et al., "Commerce as 95-102, see Figure David et al., "Bidders Start 1-58113-683-8/03/0007 Becker et al., "Transition 2003, pages 41-48, XPO Bartolini et al., "Archite Road, BS34 8QZ, Briston Fonseca et al., "Towards Engineering Bldg, Santa Heath, IP5 3RE, simon. 2	and Web Technologe 17, section 1, gs of the IASTE Press, see abstraunications of the es 1 and 2, see parategy For Multi, 14 July 2002, pn-Independent I 02302634 octing for Reuser ol, UK, 2002 san Agent Negola Cruz, CA and 2.thompson@bt.	ologies 3 rd International Conferent page 18, section 3.1 and page 20 ED International Conference Artifact, page 389, section 3 and Figure ACM, Vol. 41, No. 5, May 199 page 96 righthand column and page 1:-Attribute Sequential English Appages 457-464, XP002302633 Decentralized Markov Decision Pattern Language", UC S BTexact Technologies, Orion Bucom, 2002	ice, EC-Web 2002), section 3.2.1 Gicial Intelligence a re 1 8, "Supporting the ge 102 righthand couction with a Dead rocesses", AAMAS omated Negotiation anta Cruz/BTexact ilding, 1st Floor, pr	Proceedings and Application Negotiation blumn line", AAMA S 03, 14 July a", HP Labor Technologie 12 Adastral	Life Cyc AS 03, N 2003, 18 atories, I s, Baskir Park, Ma	le", o. AC July filton
	Aknine, "E-Commerce a Springer Verlag, see page Carbo et al., "Proceeding published 2001, ACTA Robinson et al., "Commerce as 95-102, see Figure David et al., "Bidders Start 1-58113-683-8/03/0007 Becker et al., "Transition 2003, pages 41-48, XPO Bartolini et al., "Archite Road, BS34 8QZ, Bristo Fonseca et al., "Toward Engineering Bldg, Santa Heath, IP5 3RE, simon. 2 Ankolekar et al., "DAM	and Web Technologe 17, section 1, gs of the IASTE Press, see abstraunications of thes 1 and 2, see parategy For Multi, 14 July 2002, pn-Independent I 02302634 acting for Reuse ol, UK, 2002 an Agent Nego a Cruz, CA and atthompson@bt. L-S Web Service	ologies 3 rd International Conferent page 18, section 3.1 and page 20 ED International Conference Artifact, page 389, section 3 and Figure ACM, Vol. 41, No. 5, May 199 page 96 righthand column and page 1:-Attribute Sequential English Ampages 457-464, XP002302633 Decentralized Markov Decision Position Pattern Language", UC September 2002 and 2002 are Description for the Semantic Westernation Pattern Language and Compage 2002 are Description for the Semantic Westernation Pattern Language and Compage 2002 are Description for the Semantic Westernation Pattern Language and Compage 2002 are Description for the Semantic Westernation Pattern Language and Compage 2002 are Description for the Semantic Westernation Patternation Patte	ice, EC-Web 2002 I, section 3.2.1 The cial Intelligence a rection 1 Intelligence a rection 1 Intelligence a rection 1 Intelligence a rection 2 Intelligence a rection 2 Intelligence a rection 3 Int	Proceedings Ind Application Negotiation Dlumn line", AAMA S 03, 14 July ", HP Labor Technologie 12 Adastral logies, Carne	Life Cyc AS 03, N 2003, 18 atories, I s, Baskir Park, Ma	le", o. AC July filton
	Aknine, "E-Commerce a Springer Verlag, see page Carbo et al., "Proceeding published 2001, ACTA Robinson et al., "Commerce as 95-102, see Figure David et al., "Bidders Start 1-58113-683-8/03/0007 Becker et al., "Transition 2003, pages 41-48, XPO Bartolini et al., "Archite Road, BS34 8QZ, Bristo Fonseca et al., "Toward Engineering Bldg, Santa Heath, IP5 3RE, simon. 2 Ankolekar et al., "DAM	and Web Technologe 17, section 1, gs of the IASTE Press, see abstraunications of thes 1 and 2, see parategy For Multi, 14 July 2002, pn-Independent I 02302634 acting for Reuse ol, UK, 2002 an Agent Nego a Cruz, CA and atthompson@bt. L-S Web Service	ologies 3 rd International Conferent page 18, section 3.1 and page 20 ED International Conference Artifact, page 389, section 3 and Figure ACM, Vol. 41, No. 5, May 199 page 96 righthand column and page 1:-Attribute Sequential English Appages 457-464, XP002302633 Decentralized Markov Decision Pattern Language", UC S BTexact Technologies, Orion Bucom, 2002	ice, EC-Web 2002 I, section 3.2.1 The cial Intelligence a rection 1 Intelligence a rection 1 Intelligence a rection 1 Intelligence a rection 2 Intelligence a rection 2 Intelligence a rection 3 Int	Proceedings Ind Application Negotiation Dlumn line", AAMA S 03, 14 July ", HP Labor Technologie 12 Adastral logies, Carne	Life Cyc AS 03, N 2003, 18 atories, I s, Baskir Park, Ma	le", o. AC July filton

Date Considered

*Examiner